

Annex E: Evaluation Audit Trail Template

(To be completed by the Project Management to show how the received comments on the draft report have (or have not) been incorporated into the report of the evaluation. This audit trail should be included as an annex in the final evaluation report.)

To the comments received in *January 2025* from the “Enhancing the Maritime Safety and Security and the Fight Against Terrorism in the Gulf of Guinea” project (Reference: C2023.TARPT138.DEUMFA)”

The following comments were provided in track changes to the draft evaluation report; they are referenced by author (“Author” column) and track change comment number (“#” column):

Author	#	Para No./ comment location	Comment/Feedback on the draft evaluation report	Evaluator response and actions taken
Olé Kauert	1	Para 1. Page ii	United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR)	Thanks, amended.
Olé Kauert	2	Para 1. Page ii	Official name is „Enhancing the Maritime Safety and Security and Fight against Terrorism in the Gulf of Guinea Region“	Amended.
Olé Kauert	3	Para 1. Page ii	See above comment on UNITAR	Noted
Olé Kauert	4	Executive Summary. Para. 1.	What is recently? Can this be specified such as From 202X onwards?	Adjusted to “For the past ten years”
Olé Kauert	5	Executive Summary. Para. 2. Page v	UNITAR	Spelling was added back, as first time in the Ex. Summary.
Olé Kauert	6	Executive Summary. Para. 2. Page v	ISMI	Spelling was added back, as first time in the Ex. Summary.
Olé Kauert	7	Executive Summary. Para. 5. Page v	Increased/strengthened/enhanced	See below.

Frank Borchers	8	Executive Summary. Para. 5. Page v	strengthened	Replaced by strengthened
Olé Kauert	9	Executive Summary. Para. 7. Page v	Côte d'Ivoire.	Thanks, amended.
Frank Borchers	10	Executive Summary. Para. 1. Page vi	Please elaborate...	Added: "Indeed, the level one reaction questionnaire deployed by ISMI was not aligned with the UNITAR required values of job relevance, intent to use, new information and overall usefulness and information could hence not be compared to other UNITAR training".
Olé Kauert	11	Executive Summary. Para. 3. Page vi	Earlier use of „Federal Ministry for Foreign Affairs of the Federal Republic of Germany“; be consistent with usage of term Possible link to footnote?	Replaced by German Federal Foreign Office (GFF)
Olé Kauert	12	Executive Summary. Para. 4. Page vi	redundant	Thanks, noted and deleted.
Olé Kauert	13	Executive Summary. Title coherence. Page vi	See other titles (insert paragraph)	Noted
Frank Borchers	14	Executive Summary. Para. 7. Page vi	A concrete collaboration and/or coordination was not foreseen as the project targeted solely ISMI. And, as mentioned most EU projects were concluded when TARPT138 started.	Changed to "The evaluation found no instances of concrete coordination or collaboration with these actors. This is because the project was exclusively focused on ISMI, and, as noted, most EU projects had already concluded when the evaluated project began."
Olé Kauert	15	Executive Summary. Para. 7. Page vi	Insert paragraph	Noted

Olé Kauert	16	Executive Summary. Para. 10 (second column). Page vi	Have same distance to next paragraph	Noted and modified
Frank Borchers	17	Executive Summary. Para.3 Page vii	Achieving the goal of 30% is ambitious as this is still a male dominated environment. What is considered implementing a sustainable approach. Please give sample when using the terminology.	Changed to “While the project did integrate environmental and gender considerations into its design, ensuring adequate gender participation proved to be a significant challenge throughout its implementation. Achieving a 30% female participation rate is an ambitious goal, especially considering that the maritime security field is still largely male-dominated. Nonetheless, proactive measures and a focused approach are necessary to increase female representation and foster a more inclusive environment in this sector”
Olé Kauert	18	Executive Summary. Para.8 (second column). Page vii	97; ideally ensure consistency in terms of whether numbers are spelled or written out	Changed.
Frank Borchers	19	Executive Summary. Para.2 (second column). Page viii	The benefit of networking amongst the participants and creation of Whatsapp groups to stay in touch and exchange knowledge should be also considered.	Added « The networking opportunities among participants and the creation of WhatsApp groups for staying connected and exchanging knowledge proved to be a valuable practice, fostering collaboration and continuous learning.”
Olé Kauert	20	Executive Summary. Para.10 (second column). Page viii	IUU fishing (if suggestion in terms of earlier introduction of abbreviation is taken on)	Noted with thanks and included.

Frank Borchers	21	Executive Summary. Recommendation 6. Page ix	UNITAR can do a lot indeed, but it all narrows down to the availability of funding and the directive given by the donor.	Noted and added: "However, it is important to acknowledge that while UNITAR has significant capacity to act, the scope of its efforts is ultimately influenced by the availability of funding and the priorities established by the donor."
Olé Kauert	22	Executive Summary. Lessons Learned, para.1. Page x	Safe Port has never been introduced as an abbreviation. This requires some more explanation	Noted and replaced by "project".
Frank Borchers	23	Executive Summary. Lessons Learned, para.1. Page x	Better to use the terminology "the project"	Replaced by the project.
Frank Borchers	24	Executive Summary. Lessons Learned, para.6. Page x	The timely selection process is very much depending on the availability of funds and the length of the implementation period/timeline.	LL complemented with "However, the effectiveness of this process largely depends on the availability of funds and the length of the implementation timeline"
Frank Borchers	25	Executive Summary. Lessons Learned, para.8. Page x	I disagree as the buy-in at strategic and senior/mid management level is crucial, especially at the beginning of the training courses. These levels are the decision makers. Operational level should be targeted, yes, but mid-/long term.	Valid point and amended to "Focusing primarily on management-level participants was crucial, especially at the beginning of the project. While targeting operational-level personnel, such as dockworkers and stevedores, is important, it is better suited for mid- to long-term implementation. This approach effectively prioritizes strategic engagement but also underscores the need for greater inclusivity to broaden the programme's overall impact"
Frank Borchers	26	Executive Summary. Lessons	Timelines in training/project management are defined by the availability of funds. Training at training centers should have a long term vision by default. There will be follow up training once the financial means are available.	Thanks, amended to "The two-year timeline presented limitations in fully addressing systemic

		Learned, para.9. Page x		challenges, highlighting the value of establishing a long-term capacity-building framework and incorporating follow-up mechanisms to ensure sustainable progress. However, in training and project management, timelines are primarily determined by the availability of funds. Training should, by default, adopt a long-term vision.”
Olé Kauert	27	Section of Acronyms and abbreviations. Page xi	AILCT - Académie Internationale de Lutte Contre Le Terrorisme	Change not accepted. Changed back to not italics to align with UN editorial manual.
Olé Kauert	28	Section of Project description, objectives and development context, para.5. pag 3	See earlier comment; GFFO	Thanks, added
Olé Kauert	29	Section of Methodology and limitations, para.14. pag 5	Specify date as 24 September 2024	Thanks, added
Olé Kauert	30	Subsection of Ethical Standards, para.27. pag 9	AE or BE? Which language to use throughout document?	BE. Replaced with “evaluation process”
Olé Kauert	31	Subsection of Limitations, Para.28 pag 10	See comment above	Changed to “the project”
Olé Kauert	32	Section of Findings-Relevance, para.34, pag 11	Stick to one style of writing	Noted, font changed.
Olé Kauert	33	Section of Findings-Relevance, para.41, pag 13	They as in the countries or the ports?	Ports, amended.

Olé Kauert	34	Section of Findings-Relevance, para.41, pag 13	Plural; otherwise state specific ISPS Code	Not changed, there is only one ISPS Code
Olé Kauert	35	Section of Findings-Relevance, para.42, pag 13	Format should ideally be in line with the other parts/quotes	Noted and adjusted.
Olé Kauert	36	Section of Findings-Coherence, para.53, pag 17	This may have to be added to the list of abbreviations	Added
Olé Kauert	37	Section of Findings-Coherence, para.56, pag 19	This sentence is somewhat confusing to read	Amended, see below
Frank Borchers	38	Section of Findings-Coherence, para.56, pag 19	Please define national training programs as ISPS Code is international standard	Amended to "National training programmes focusing on the ISPS Code, self-assessment and audits, as well as drills and exercises, have been conducted within the framework of this project."
Olé Kauert	39	Section of Findings-Coherence, para.57, pag 19	Alphabetical order	Noted and adjusted.
Frank Borchers	40	Section of Findings-Coherence, para.60, pag 20	Keep in mind the regional outreach of the project	Noted : added « across the region«
Olé Kauert	41	Section of Findings-Coherence, para.62, pag 21	Where? In Abidjan?	In the countries of intervention. Added.
Olé Kauert	42	Section of Findings-Coherence, para.63, pag 21	Anti-chronological order possibly an idea?	Noted and change the order.
Olé Kauert	43	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.67, pag 23	Unavailability?	Yes, thanks. Added.
Frank Borchers	44	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.69, pag 23	You might rephrase as availability of trainers has also to do with timely planning of the trainings, which is an issue when there is late funding	Noted, changed to: The issue of trainer unavailability may be linked to the need for timely planning of training, as delays in

				funding can affect both the scheduling and the availability of qualified trainers, which in turn highlights a potential gap in expertise on port security topics within the sub-region.”
Olé Kauert	45	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.72, pag 24	This way spelling is consistent with one used below	Noted
Olé Kauert	46	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.76, pag 25	This evaluation has often not used %; important to ensure consistency and coherence	Noted and corrected.
Olé Kauert	47	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.77, pag 25	So far it has been abbreviated as ENCVR	Noted and amended
Olé Kauert	48	Table 3, Number countries involved	Alphabetical order	Noted and reordered
Olé Kauert	49	Table 4, Number countries involved	Alphabetical order and in English	Noted and corrected
Olé Kauert	50	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.82, pag 29	This reads confusing	Reformulated
Frank Borchers	51	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.101, pag 33	Please define several, was it only one or two or...	Number of stakeholders (5) so was included.
Olé Kauert	52	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.106, pag 35	This reads strange	Reformulated, see below
Frank Borchers	53	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.106, pag 35	Please rephrase the sentence, e.g. The project team did not explicitly explain all policies related to certification, evaluation...	Noted « However, the project team did not provide ISMI with a detailed briefing on UNITAR’s policies related to certification, evaluation, and its quality assurance framework, which are applicable to training events implemented by implementing partners. “

Olé Kauert	54	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.108, pag 35	Coherent writing style with numbers (ninety-seven vs 97) is important	Noted, it is spelled out since it is at the beginning of the sentence as per UN spelling convention.
Olé Kauert	55	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.108, pag 35	See above	Noted
Frank Borchers	56	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.108, pag 35	We always talk about ISMI. The funding numbers in this case relate to the overall project, meaning AILCT and ISMI together. Please adapt the numbers.	Noted and text adjusted.
Olé Kauert	57	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.109, pag 35	See above	Noted, it needs to be spelled out as per UN spelling convention.
Frank Borchers	58	Section of Findings-Effectiveness, para.112, pag 36	The aim of gender equality has also to reflect the training environment, cultural background and other factors.	Noted and added: Achieving gender equality must also consider the training environment, cultural context, and other influencing factors to ensure an inclusive and effective approach.
Frank Borchers	59	Section of Findings-Likelihood of Impact, rating	I would highly reconsider the rating to satisfactory	Noted with thanks. Adjusted to satisfactory.
Olé Kauert	59	Section of Findings-Likelihood of Impact, para.115, pag 37	See above	Noted, but not adjusted
Frank Borchers	60	Section of Findings-Likelihood of Impact, para.121, pag 38	The number of beneficiaries very much depends on the availability of funds and the period of time available for implementing the training courses. Strategic-, Senior- and Middle Management Level should be used to multiply the knowledge to the operational personnel.-	Noted and added: It is important to note that the number of beneficiaries is largely determined by the availability of funds and the timeframe for implementing the training courses. To maximize impact, a strategic focus on training senior and middle management levels is essential, as they can effectively disseminate knowledge to operational personnel, ensuring broader reach and sustainability of the training

				outcomes.
Olé Kauert	61	Section of Findings-Likelihood of Impact, para.130, pag 41	It would be good to have consistent use of project's name	Noted, replaced by "the project"
Frank Borchers	62	Section of Findings-Likelihood of Impact, para.131, pag 41	The availability of funds and time for implementation are the determining factor in this equation.	Noted and included in a footnote
Frank Borchers	63	Section of Findings-Likelihood of Impact, para.131, pag 41	Please determine several...	About 25% of the people interviewed during the evaluation process indicated the need for further training.
Frank Borchers	64	Section of Findings-Likelihood of Impact, para.131, pag 41	Follow up initiatives are also defined by the availability of funds. Networking amongst peers, creation of Whatsapp groups amongst trainees are also follow up mechanisms.	Noted and added in a footnote
Olé Kauert	65	Section of Conclusions, para.145, pag 46	Otherwise, it would be good to be specific which ISPS Code is referred to	Noted, changed to singular
Olé Kauert	66	Section of Conclusions, para.146, pag 46	Who is the project here? The project itself did not ensure visibility	Noted, changed to "project management"
Olé Kauert	67	Section of Draft Recommendations, para.1, pag 48	Format should be streamlined across different sections of this evaluation	Noted
Frank Borchers	68	Section of Draft Recommendations, para.5, pag 49	Pre-training test make sense but their influence is limited since sometimes the participants are appointed by port authorities.	Noted, complemented with « Ideally, the selection criteria would be more efficient if supported by a pre-training questionnaire to assess participants' level of expertise. While a pre-training test makes sense, its impact is limited, as participants were appointed by port authorities.»

Frank Borchers	69	Section of Draft Recommendations, para.6, pag 49	Ambitious targets for medium term approach when funding is limited	Timeframe adjusted to “medium to long term approach”
Frank Borchers	70	Section of Lessons Learned, para.4, pag 50	Please define the proactive measure as this a general term	Noted, complemented with: “such as targeted outreach and recruitment, gender-sensitive training materials “
Frank Borchers	71	Section of Lessons Learned, para.7, pag 50	The limitation of experts resulted mainly from the short implementation phase caused through late funding.	LL clarified: The shortage of experts was primarily due to the shortened implementation phase, which was caused by delays in funding.
Frank Borchers	72	Section of Lessons Learned, para.8, pag 50	The focus of the project is primarily defined by the donor who defines the target group(s) as part of the regional approach and political guidance.	Completed and text adjusted accordingly.
Frank Borchers	73	Annex C: List of interviewees, No.23, pg 78	The person is listed twice, see under 16.	Noted and deleted
Frank Borchers	74	Presentation of findings, recommendation 5	Agreed with the recommendation, including the different levels: basic, intermediate and advanced, but implementation will depend on the funding and direction of the donor. ISMI is included in the EU-funded project.	Noted, constraints related to pre-training questionnaires acknowledged in the recommendation 5.
Ole Kauert	75	Presentation of findings, recommendation 1	IUU training seems indeed very relevant to maritime actors in the sector and region.	Noted
Frank Borchers	76	Presentation of findings, recommendation 5	Agree with the recommendation but UNITAR influence is limited on the participants’ nomination process.	Noted
Frank Borchers	77	Presentation of findings, recommendation 7	Noted, 1 st time partnering with ISMI	Noted
Frank Borchers and Ole Kauert	78	Presentation of findings, recommendation 2	Agree, they expect to have more coordination with the EU with the new EU-funded project that will be implemented with ISMI as a partner and now have since end of 2024 created their presence in Brussels.	Noted and added a note to recommendation 2.
Frank Borchers	79	Presentation of findings, recommendation 3	Agreed but to train, e.g., dock personnel, they need to make sure that the port management staff (senior management) is on board, followed by mid-level. This is priority staff and afterwards they can expand.	Noted. Referred to consider training dock personnel more on the long-term which implies that management levels comes first.

Ole Kauert	80	Presentation of findings, recommendation 3	A bottom-up approach was also discussed during the conference in Cabo Verde for the regional level.	Noted. No changes to recommendation 3.
Frank Borchers	81	Presentation of findings, recommendation 6	Training participants have established WhatsApp groups. Coaching might be too ambitious for them given limited resources for the short term but important to consider for the medium term. Agree with the simulation exercises.	Noted, changed reference to coaching and adjusted priority to medium to long.
Frank Borchers and Ole Kauert	82	Presentation of findings, recommendation 4	Note and agreed. It might be possible to organize a dedicated training for women.	Noted